

**CIVIL DIMENSION
OF SECURITY**

244 CC 04 E
Original: English



NATO Parliamentary Assembly

SUMMARY

of the meeting of the Committee on the Civil Dimension of Security
Palazzo del Casino, Lido, Venice, Italy

Saturday 13th and Sunday 14th November 2004

ATTENDANCE LIST

Chairperson	Alice Mahon (United Kingdom)
Vice-Chairpersons	Christine Boutin (France) Lucio Malan (Italy)
General Rapporteur	Verena Wohlleben (Germany)
Vice-Chairmen of the Sub-committee on Democratic Governance	Jon Lilletun (Norway) Scott McInnis (United States)
President of the NATO-PA	Douglas Bereuter (United States)
Secretary General	Simon Lunn
Member Delegations	
Belgium	Mia De Schamphelaere
Bulgaria	Nikolai Kamov
	Tchetin Kazak
Canada	Leon Benoit
	Jane Cordy
	Joseph A. Day
	Pierre Claude Nolin
Czech Republic	Pavel Severa
Estonia	Tiit Matsulevits
France	Jean Puech
Germany	Wolfgang Börnsen
	Helga Daub
	Monika Heubaum
	Robert Hochbaum
	Erwin Marschewski
	Harald Schliemann
	Andreas Weigel
Greece	Sofia Kalantzakou
Latvia	Andris Berzins
	Aleksandrs Kiršteins
Lithuania	Algirdas Gričius
	Alvydas Sadeckas
Luxemburg	Marc Angel
Netherlands	Bert Middel
Poland	Antoni Macierewicz
Portugal	Alberto Costa
	João Rebelo
Slovakia	Eva Cerná
Spain	Hilario Caballero
Turkey	Ö. Zülfü Livaneli
	Ahmed Faruk Ünsal
United Kingdom	Michael Clapham
	Bruce George
	Lord Jopling

United States

Michael Bilirakis
 John Boozman
 Joann Emerson
 Dennis Moore
 John Tanner
 Tom Udall

Associate delegations

Albania

Armenia

Austria

Azerbaijan

Croatia

Georgia

Russian Federation

Sweden

the former Yugoslav Republic
of Macedonia

Ukraine

Bamir Topi
 Aleksan Karapetyan
 Mher Shahgeldyan
 Maximilian Hofmann
 Katharina Pfeffer
 Ziyafat Asgarov
 Siyavush Novruzov
 Marin Jurjevic
 Velimir Plesa
 David Gamkrelidze
 Nicholas Rurua
 Giorgi Targamadze
 Viktor A. Ozerov
 Oleg Tatarinov
 Shamil Zainalov
 Andrey Zhukov
 Asa Lindestam
 Slobodan Casule
 Esad Rahic
 Volodymyr Zaplatynskyi

European Parliament

Paulo Casaca
 Vasco Graça Moura
 Pawel Piskorski

Parliamentary observers

Japan

Serbia and Montenegro

Shintaro Ito
 Masataka Suzuki
 Aleksandar Zuric

Parliamentary Guests

Algeria

Jordan

Mauritani

Mahdjoub Bedda
 Audeh Qawas
 Cherif Ahmed Ould Mohamed Moussa

Speakers

Antonio d'Ali, Deputy Minister for Home Affairs, Italy

Brigadier General Corrado Dalzini, former
 Commander of the combined military
 contingent in Iraq, Italy

* Turkey recognises the Republic of Macedonia with its constitutional name.

Pietro Del Sette, NGO *Movimondo*, Head of
the Middle East Unit

Sabine Freizer, Caucasus Project Director,
International Crisis Group, Georgia

Robert Ménard, Director, Reporters Without
Borders, Paris

Rodney Pinder, Director, International News
Safety Institute, Brussels

Andrea Rossi, Project Officer on Child
Trafficking Research, *Innocenti Research*
Centre, UNICEF, Italy

International Secretariat

Raphaëlle Mathey, Director of the Committee
Isabelle Arcis, Co-ordinator of the Committee
Roberta Calorio, Coordinator, Rose Roth
seminars
Leslie Fields, Research Assistant

Committee Secretary

Emily Delfau

I. Introductory remarks

1. The chairperson, **Alice Mahon** (UK), introduced the agenda of the meeting [186 CC 04 E rev.1]. **The draft agenda and the minutes of the meeting of the Committee in Bratislava were adopted without comments.**

II. Presentation by Antonio d'Ali, Italian Deputy Minister of Home Affairs on *The Fight against Trafficking in Children and the Action of the Italian Government* followed by Q&A

2. **Antonio d'Ali** began his presentation by reading a speech on behalf of the Italian Minister of Interior with regards to the problem of child trafficking in this country. The Italian government has taken extensive initiatives to curb child trafficking, and has reached positive results thanks to network links with a number of national bodies and international institutions involved in fighting organised crime. In Italy, special attention has been focused on the Balkans because of the proximity to Italy. The Italian government has signed a number of conventions and working documents aiming at fighting organised crime and children trafficking, which involves a memorandum of understanding between Russia and Serbia with Italy. Mr d'Ali also outlined the recent measures adopted by police forces to fight trafficking. In addition he explained in detail to the Committee members the concrete difficulties faced by his minister with this delicate task. Child trafficking is constantly on the rise in Italy. It is an illegal business that is often run by criminal organisations based abroad. The problem of trafficking is relevant not only to children, but men and women as well. Directly linked to the problem of child trafficking is that of drug trafficking and money laundering. This phenomenon especially threatens illegal migrants to Italy who are often ill-treated, sexually exploited and abused, and placed in a situation with a lack of options.

III. Presentation by Andrea Rossi, Project Officer on Child Trafficking Research, *Innocenti Research Centre, UNICEF on Child Trafficking Research in Europe: Issues and Challenges* followed by Q&A

3. **Andrea Rossi's** presentation focused on child trafficking and the rights of the child. He highlighted the major problems involved in trafficking. The invisibility of trafficking makes it difficult to gather accurate statistics, or pinpoint origins and precise nature and scale of the problem. The fact that trafficking is a dynamic process further complicates the gathering of information, as there is often movement across state lines, and the temporal issue, as trafficking can start when a child is young and progress through adulthood. Another problem in addressing trafficking is the gap between commitments and real action on the issue. Trafficking must be properly defined, and recognised as a crime before any substantive action can be taken. The division of origin, transit and destination are no longer adequate classifications, as the phenomena of trafficking is in many types and can be found everywhere. We must look at patterns, and especially the connection between Africa and Europe. Mr Rossi emphasised the necessity of institutional asymmetry in regard to definitions of trafficking and laws, and recalled that progress in this fight can only be achieved with a strong and active international co-operation.

4. **Sofia Kalantzakou** (GR) asked about the relationship between strict adoption laws in Europe and the rise in trafficking for the sale of children. The chairperson asked if there was a rising trend in a particular kind of trafficking. **Lord Jopling** (UK) noted the work of a British charity, Hope and Homes for Children, that picks up children before trafficking, and suggested that more steps should be taken to put destitute children in family environments before traffickers can get to them. **João Rebelo** (PT) noted that the lack of sanction alignment throughout all countries leads

traffickers to indulge in countries where sanctions are weak, thus, countries should work to impose common sanctions.

5. Mr Rossi noted the problems researchers encounter in gathering helpful statistics because of the lack of transparency. Therefore, there is difficulty in highlighting specific trends. Addressing the question of illegal adoptions, Mr Rossi noted the importance, but acknowledged the difficulty in addressing the problem because the people involved do not want to be discovered. Furthermore, Mr Rossi pointed out the delicate issue of returning children to their origins and the necessity of the international community to support and enhance international collaboration. Mr Rossi emphasised the necessity of moving from implementation to action. Concerning sanctions, Mr Rossi agreed with Mr Rebelo that harmonisation of sanctions would be a good deterrent, but co-operation would be needed on all levels to prevent crime, leaving sanctions as the final part of action.

IV. Consideration of the Draft Report of the Sub-Committee on Democratic Governance on *The Fight against Children Trafficking in Europe* [157 CCDG 04 E] and presentation by Alice Mahon of the draft Resolution on *Children Trafficking in Europe* [187 CC 04 E] in the absence of Gudmundur Árni Stefánsson (Iceland), Rapporteur of the Sub-Committee

6. Trafficking in human beings is an important threat to the security, stability and social cohesion of societies in the Euro-Atlantic area, as well as an unacceptable violation of human dignity and fundamental rights. The phenomenon has a negative effect on both countries of origin, and destination. In Europe, trafficking in children is gaining a new impetus. The lack of statistical data in this area makes tackling the problem difficult, although absence of reliable data should not be an excuse for ignoring the problem. The report addresses changing patterns in trafficking, as well as highlighting the other complexities involved with the issue. In addition, there is detailed attention paid to the problems involved with taking proper measures against trafficking. The report applauds some positive developments implemented in fighting trafficking, but yet insufficient to curb this traffic. Still there is impressive willingness and dedication on the part of governments and organisations to participate in international efforts against trafficking.

7. **Lord Jopling** (UK) emphasised the importance of reliable data, pointing to specific points in the report, which he submitted formally as an amendment. **Michael Clapham** (UK) noted possible confusion between "children and minors". **Joann Emerson** (US) pointed out that the report does not deal with the issue of "Sex Tourism", which the US Congress has noted to be a problem in relation to trafficking. **João Rebelo** (PT) emphasised the lack of statistical studies and information regarding the subject. He also pointed to the necessity of fighting pedophilia, which is a problem in the western world in general. **Jane Cordy** (CA) further stressed the importance of reliable data, recalling a report from Interpol suggesting that human trafficking has overcome arms trafficking.

The chairperson requested that all amendments to the report be submitted in writing.

The draft Report [157 CCDG 04 E] was adopted unanimously.

V. Brief presentation by Andrey Zhukov (Russia) on the Beslan Event

8. **Andrey Zhukov** (RU) shared information as a rank and file member of the Russian parliament, although he noted that this was not an official report. Mr Zhukov recalled the terrible events of September 1, which led to the questions still pending: who were these terrorists, what were their motivation, who was directing them? They were 32 well-trained individuals representing

different national groups, citizens of different states, well equipped, displaying professional skills. However, these people were not prepared for a suicide mission. Rather, they were obviously suspecting support from outside, waiting for directives. However, once the terrorists realised that directives were not coming, they were transformed into a state of panic and tension. They had no strategic plan, or official order, and rather acted on impulse. On the second day a special squad team was sent by the federal authorities, but given explicit instructions not to use any force. There is no confirmation as to who organised the terrorists. Since then a parliamentary task force has been nominated, measures have been taken in securing the safety of schools, and parliamentarians have been discussing the issue of international collaboration in counter-acting terrorism. There are many questions evolving from this terrible tragedy. Massive measures have been taken in social rehabilitation.

9. The chairperson thanked Mr Zhukov for his presentation, and suggested that we could all learn from the frightening and horrifying terrorist acts. The whole world's sympathy went to the Russian people after the terrifying act. **Jon Lilletun** (NO) extended his sympathy to the people of Russia, and expressed his belief that the most important thing to do in the fight against terrorism is bring welfare and justice to society.

VI. Presentation by Robert Ménard, Director of Reporters Without Borders, on *The Media Front in wartime*

10. **Robert Ménard** discussed the problems faced by journalists during the Iraq war. More journalists have been killed so far in Iraq than during all of Vietnam. The problem highlighted by Mr Ménard is not that journalists have been killed during wartime, but rather that their deaths have not yet led to any substantial investigations, like in Iraq or Israel. During the past 20 years, democracies have learned that wars are not only won and lost on the military and diplomatic front, but also on the media front. Thus, as much as possible they try to control the image and information conveyed by the media because of the importance of public opinion. The principle of freedom of press is unfortunately not recognised by all and new conflicts have given rise to general non-compliance with Geneva Conventions. Mr Ménard also stressed the confusions often made by military instances between media and a tool of military propaganda or a military objective. In all wars TV and radio stations are first to be destroyed to undermine the enemy's communication capacity. Mr Ménard also expressed concern in America's monitoring of Arab media and questioned -in particular- whether the pressure being exerted on Al Jazeera can be justified. Although they may be considered to be propaganda, and propaganda is unacceptable, the price of democracy may be the toleration of some types of propaganda. Mr Ménard observed that increased violation of the principle of freedom of press and on the Geneva Conventions are tolerated and this causes prejudice to the quality of the media reporting. The speaker continued by suggesting ways in which parliamentarians can improve the conditions of journalists during wartime. Rather than creating new conventions, we must work to properly implement and respect the principles set in the existing conventions. Furthermore, there must be work to ensure the safety of journalists through proper insurance, and proper investigations, and a balance must be found between security and freedom.

VII. Presentation by Rodney Pinder, Director, International News Safety Institute, on *Media and Military at War - Fatal Misunderstandings*

11. **Rodney Pinder** stressed the necessity of understanding how modern wars are being conducted. The first casualties in Iraq were of those who chose to support the truth. There is no suggestion that the United States has deliberately targeted journalists, however, avoidable communication misunderstandings have played a part. Mr Pinder pointed to the example of the shooting at the Palestine hotel to emphasise communication failure between military and

journalists that can lead to death. The speaker addressed measures to increase the safety of journalists, and noted that both media and military have a responsibility to move forward, suggesting that NATO can be at the forefront of this effort. Pointing to the example of Israel, Mr Pinder suggested that including journalists in military training could be a positive step. The military must understand what drives the media and recognise the right of journalists to be in their space. It is the duty to report to the public via media when things go wrong. There must be substantial efforts to reduce careless, haphazard, unthinking media fatalities on the battlefield.

12. The chairperson was appalled that Al Jazeera and other Arab networks have been banned, given that they were the news agency that brought us pictures of reality during the war. **Tchetin Kazak** (BG) suggested that journalists need to better organise themselves on both the national and international levels to advocate their rights. **Michael Clapham** (UK) asked if the embedding of journalists results in critical faculty. **Tom Udall** (US) asked if embedding reinforces the control of authorities over the media. **Lucio Malan** (IT) questioned as to why Italy was described as a special case of uninsured journalists and further pointed out that all Italian hostages are now home which is not the case in all other countries. **Bert Middel** (NL) noted that there are many different types of journalists. Mr Rebelo cited an example of Portuguese journalists who got into trouble on a mission in Kuwait and stressed the importance of properly preparing journalists for hostile environments. **Jane Cordy** (CA) noted the success of educating journalists, but wondered if there was success in regard to educating military personnel, and suggested that the public should be better educated as well.

13. Mr Pinder stated, in response to a question from the Bulgarian delegate, that there is already an international journalists union, which is a conglomeration of local journalist unions. It is also the role of parliamentarians to question the owners of media companies as to what they are doing to address the problems faced by journalists. Mr Ménard stressed concern that owners are concerned with salaries of journalists, but not security. There have been developments towards updating and making corrections on the Geneva Conventions, but nothing has been implemented. The idea of making a universal sign for journalists is not to be encouraged and could even be dangerous, as it will only make them bigger targets. Requests have been made for discussions with NATO to influence the military that journalists exist and working together is essential. Embedded journalists are only part of the way to get information. It cannot be the only way or unique source of information. Regarding embedded journalists, it is important to realise that embedding involves limits and constraints. Addressing Mr Malan, Mr Ménard explained that his example of Italy was only used because it was a big country with big press. Mr Pinder addressed the question of embeds by acknowledging that while embeds are largely controlled by the military, there are also emotional problems with embeds, given that journalists are human and will be inclined to form bonds with surrounding soldiers. There is an obvious conflict of interest. Mr Ménard addressed Ms Cordy's question by noting that joint training has not yet taken place. He agreed with Mr Middel that there are different types of journalists, but further pointed out that it is a problem, as the price of free press is also that anyone can be a journalist. Mr Pinder agreed with Ms Cordy that the public must be better educated, and much work is needed to change the credibility of journalists.

VIII. Presentation by Brigadier General Corrado Dalzini, Former Commander of the Combined Military Contingent in Iraq

14. **General Dalzini** noted that the activities carried out by the Italian military in Iraq have not only been involved in the area of security and humanitarian aid, but the Italian mission has also involved reconstruction. The General continued by elaborating upon an Italian method of embedding journalists into the military structures. The method allows journalists to plan their activities on the basis of their needs and interests. Journalists want to be where there is action,

and this approach allows them more flexibility. The General stated the willingness of the military to improve the relationship with journalists, but noted that his experiences thus far have been quite good.

IX. Presentation by Pietro Del Sette, NGO *Movimondo*, Head of the Middle East Unit

15. **Mr. Del Sette** discussed the relationship between Iraq armed forces and the Italian NGO, *Molvimondo*. The approach in Iraq can be carried out only if humanitarian aid is carried out in accordance with the true needs of the recipients. The goals of the organisation have decreased the need for Italians by transferring responsibilities to Iraqis. The experience gained in Iraq and the Phillipines has proven that the best way to carry out work is to strengthen the relationship between the organisation and recipient countries. Mr Del Sette expressed concern in the fact that relations with the media always result in negative news, although many positive developments have been made in Iraq. Small mistakes are enhanced and amplified by the media while positive results are overshadowed.

16. **Michael Clapham** (UK) asked General Dalzini if the semi-embedded personnel were given military training and advised of risks. Mr Clapham further inquired as to how the military communicated with them to ensure their safety when carrying out unilateral roles. **Joann Emerson** (US) stressed common frustration with Mr Del Sette in the lack of positive coverage in news. **Lucio Malan** (IT) asked if the trend towards negative news is unique to Iraq.

17. Addressing Mr Clapham's question, Mr Dalzini stated that semi-embeds are given equal security conditions, as journalists still operate in limited environments. In regard to news, and the uniqueness of Iraq, bad news has been given more momentum than good news. Mr Del Sette suggested that the media are deforming the information in Iraq, and everything is reported politically. Mr. Pinder objected to the criticism of the press with the notation that there is a problem. People shouldn't criticise journalists for bringing bad news because that's their job. Violence is overshadowing the reporting of good work because violence is, in fact, overshadowing everything else. If the press should be criticised it should be for not questioning the presence of WMD in Iraq before the war. The public must be better informed.

18. **Jon Lilletun** (NO) stated that it is important for the people to see the truth, even if it is bad news, and noting the gap between what we are reading and what is really happening there is a need for more honesty and balance. **Ziyafat Asgarov** (AZ) raised the concern that the military is imposing itself in Iraq and should take religious beliefs and traditions more seriously into account.

19. Mr Del Sette addressed the comment from Azerbaijan by acknowledging that, although it is beyond the scope of his specialty, thinking that democracy is the answer for all people is not necessarily correct. It was wrong to not have a clear plan the day after the war was won in Iraq. General Dalzini suggested that his experiences in Iraq contradict the emphasis of violence portrayed by the media. The reality is sometimes different from what has been reported, and the numbers of dead do not correspond. Addressing the question posed by the Azerbaijani delegate Mr Dalzini noted that the press gave no attention to the measures taken by the military to respect the beliefs of the Iraqi people, and the propensity of understanding the situation they have been in without displaying the attitude of wanting to take over and impose themselves on the people.

X. Consideration of Amendments and Vote on the Draft Resolution on *Trafficking in Children in Europe* [187 CC 04 E] by Gudmundur Arni Stefansson (Iceland), Rapporteur of the Sub-Committee on Democratic Governance

The draft Resolution [187 CC 04 E] was adopted with amendments.

XI. Presentation by Sabine Freizer, Caucasus Project Director, International Crisis Group on *Internal Developments and Threats to Regional Security in the Caucasus*

20. **Sabine Freizer** explained the work of the ICG, and elaborated upon the organisation's presence in the Caucasus. With the Istanbul Summit, NATO has shown growing interest in the area by reaching out to Azerbaijan, Armenia and Georgia and developing closer co-operation frameworks. The attitudes of the three countries point to a difference in perception about their potential relationship with NATO. There is still a weak basis of democratic governance in the countries; Azerbaijan and Armenia's recent elections were strongly criticised, and opposition is not given a strong voice in any of the three countries. In all three states the decision-making process is very centralised and the role of regional and municipal governments are very weak. Ms Freizer noted the intense conflicts simmering in South Ossetia and Nagorno-Karabakh. The issue of status in both cases has not yet been resolved. Still, there is a sense that there may be small room for dialogue, but at this time the conflicts remain unsolved. The South Caucasus is a region plagued by political instability, frozen conflicts and regional conflicts. Ms Freizer explained the reasons for the increasing strategic importance of the region, and posed several questions for the NATO parliamentarians to address and contemplate.

21. **Bruce George** (UK) described despair at looking at the map of the Caucasus, and underlined the international interest in the region. He also expressed optimism in improving the strong executive and weak legislative natures of the systems by drawing a comparison to that of the United States. He notably congratulated the progress in Georgia and emphasised the importance of resolving the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict for the stability of the whole region. **Aleksanders KIRSTEINS** (LV) noted his surprise at seeing so many Russian officers, Russian tanks, and Russian troops in South Ossetia, and expressed concern as to the impartiality and bias of Russian peacemakers, Russia being itself a major player for the resolution of the local conflicts. **Siyavush NOVRUZOV** (AZ) stressed their good relationship with Georgia and others. Mr Novruzov asserted his view that OSCE's evaluation of their elections was unfair, pointing to the fact that Georgia, in which the president received 90% of the votes, was not equally criticized. Further underlying that unfortunately the region had already been devastated several times by terrorist attacks, he recalled and regretted that some westerns powers had been at a certain time supported some of the forces that are now working in the al-Qaeda networks.

22. Ms Freizer acknowledged Russia's important, and sometimes non-constructive role in delivering arms and fighters to South Ossetia and other places. The situation, however, is complex, as there is a territory with 90% of the population holding passports from another state. South Ossetia believes that it has status of an autonomous region, and the issue of borders has become increasingly relevant upon the breakup of the Soviet Union. However, it is not helpful when the blame is put on Russia. She added that it is time to think about the role of international political and security organisation to contribute to restoration of the peace and stability in the region.

23. **Giorgi Targamadze** (GE) denied that economic problems within the Georgian government were the only cause of the problem in South Ossetia. He claimed that the problem of South Ossetia is an artificial problem associated with Russian attempts to destabilise Georgia. He further requested help in finding a common language between Georgia and Russia, as only negotiations

can help to resolve the conflicts. Mr Targamadze expressed concern that Russia is interfering in the interests of the citizens of Abkhazia and Georgia will be ready to use any method to protect those citizens. Mr Targamadze underlined Georgia's willingness to conduct itself in a diplomatic manner to reach peaceful resolution, but suggested that Russia has a conflict of interest and cannot be considered impartial. Georgia is struggling to become an irreversible, consolidated and independent democracy with the help of NATO. **Mher Shahgeldyan** (AM) acknowledged that many things in the Caucasus depend on Russia, but stressed that problems can never be solved with force. Mr Novruzov refuted Ms Freizer's assertion that there was no opposition in Azerbaijan, and noted that there is opposition within the Parliament. Mr Novruzov further highlighted the reforms that have been made within parliament and in regard to the constitution, and justifies the president's power by the fact that the country is in a period of transition. He declared Azerbaijan as a democratic, legal, secular state, void of Islamic fundamentalism, and always supports the peaceful settlement of the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict. In this regard, he totally rejected the idea that Armenian forces are exercising their right to national self-determination in the conflict over Nagorno-Karabakh and recalled the Azerbaijani views on this conflict.

24. Ms Freizer drew attention to the importance of undertaken commitments with regard to internal reforms, division of powers and territorial integrity. Also of great importance is the role of the judiciary, media and civil society. The case of Georgia shows the positive effects of an active civil society and a dynamic opposition media within the political process.

XII. Consideration of the Draft General Report on *Stability in the Three South Caucasus Republics: Ten Years after Independence, Progress and new Challenges* [156 CC 04 E] by Verena Wholleben (Germany), Rapporteur General

25. **Verena Wholleben** recommended that the Committee reject the amendment forwarded in paragraph 31. The amendment cannot be accepted, as it disturbs the flow of thoughts by attributing the problem to Armenia. However, the Committee would like to deal with the problem in a neutral way.

26. **Joann Emerson** (US) responded to Mr Novruzov's comment by noting that over 3,000 people were killed in the twin towers, which was an act of terror that the organisation, al-Qaeda, claimed responsibility for. Going into Afghanistan was direct response to that attack. **Jon Lilletun** (NO) asked Azerbaijan if they have any members of their opposition parties within the NATO-PA. Mr Targamadze expressed hope that Georgia will one day become a full NATO member. He appealed to NATO for help in strengthening the Georgian civil society, and building a judiciary in accordance with basic principle of separation of powers. He also expressed concern over the issue of withdrawal of Russian military basis, which should have been implemented long ago. **Viktor A. Ozerov** (RU) noted that the NATO-Russia Council unanimously recognised the positive developments in the relationship between Georgia and Russia, and expressed his concern at the statements made by Mr Targamadze referring to military action. Mr Ozerov further emphasised the necessity of mutual trust and respect between the two states. **Andrey Zhukov** (RU) added to Mr Ozerov's concern with the statement made by Mr Targamadze. Mr Zhukov applauded Ms Freizer's report, and suggested that the next step should be for the Committee to examine the situation from the perspective of the people living within the region. Further, Mr Zhukov questioned the status of Georgia as a democracy and noted the active presence of external forces in Georgia and stressed in particular their role during the recent "roses Revolution". He also recalled the Committee's members the recent joint effort undertaken under Russian supervision for the restoration of a railway in the region. **Ahmed Faruk Ünsal** (TR) noted Turkey's interest in peace given its proximity to the region and suggested several amendments to the Draft Report. **Mher Shahgeldyan** (AM) emphasised the importance of dialogue in finding a solution.

Ziyafat Asgarov (AZ) answered Mr Lilletun's question by stating that there are 12 representatives within NATO PA, and 8 are from opposition parties.

The draft Report [156 CC 04 E] was adopted.

XIII. Tentative Summary of the Future Activities of the Committee and of the Sub-Committee on Democratic Governance.

27. The preliminary working programme of the Committee was adopted as follows:

Report	General Report	Sub Committee on Democratic Governance	Special report on civil protection
Rapporteur	João REBELO	Bert MIDDEL	Lord JOPLING
Preliminary titles of the report	"Assessment of NATO perspectives of collaboration with Central Asian Republics" or "Stability in Central Asia ".	Transition in the Caucasus region, Subject of the report to be further defined.	Civil protection in urban environment and big cities in case of massive terrorist attacks.
Visits	Kazakhstan and/or Uzbekistan.	Azerbaijan and Russian Federation.	United States of America and Spain and/or UK.
Time of the visit	Spring 2005: March or April.	June 2005.	US in September 2005 and UK-Spain in spring 2005.

XIV. Elections

28. The new Committee officers were elected as follows:

COMMITTEE ON THE CIVIL DIMENSION OF SECURITY

Chairman

Michael CLAPHAM
(United Kingdom, Labour)

Elected at the 50th Session
(Venice - November 2004)

Vice-Chairpersons

Christine BOUTIN
(France, UMP)

Elected at the 49th Session
(Orlando - November 2003)

Re-elected

Lucio MALAN
(Italy, Forza Italia)

Elected at the 48th Session
(Istanbul - November 2002)

Re-elected

General Rapporteur

João REBELO
(Portugal, CDS / People's Party)

Elected at the 50th Session
(Venice - November 2004)

Special Rapporteur on Civil Protection

Lord JOPLING
(United Kingdom, Conservative)

Elected at the 50th Session
(Venice - November 2004)

Sub-Committee on Democratic Governance
(Mandate changed in Berlin, November 2000)

Chairman

Jon LILLETUN
(Norway, Christian Democrat)

Elected at the 50th Session
(Venice - November 2004)

Vice-Chairpersons

Joann EMERSON
(United States, Republican)

Elected at the 50th Session
(Venice - November 2004)

Tchetin KAZAK
(Bulgaria, Movement for Rights
and Freedom)

Elected at the 50th Session
(Venice - November 2004)

Rapporteur

Bert MIDDEL
(Netherlands, Social Democrat)

Elected at the 50th Session
(Venice - November 2004)

29. The Committee expressed its appreciation for all of the great work that has been done, praised and deeply thanked Ms. Mahon on her excellent job as Chairperson of this Committee.
