

223 CDS 12 E  
Original: English



## NATO Parliamentary Assembly

### SUMMARY

of the meeting of the Committee on the Civil Dimension of Security

*Hall A, Prague Congress Centre  
Prague, Czech Republic*

Saturday 10 and Sunday 11 November 2012

International Secretariat

December 2012

**ATTENDANCE LIST**

<b>Acting Chairperson</b>	Marc ANGEL (Luxembourg)
<b>General Rapporteur</b>	Ulla SCHMIDT (Germany)
<b>Rapporteur of the Sub-Committee on Democratic Governance</b>	Lucio MALAN (Italy)
<b>Special Rapporteur</b>	Vitalino CANAS (Portugal)
<b>President of the NATO PA</b>	Karl A. LAMERS (Germany)
<b>Secretary General</b>	David HOBBS
<b>Member Delegations</b>	
Belgium	Philippe MAHOUX Martine TAELEMAN
Bulgaria	Nedzhmi ALI Assen AGOV
Canada	Leon BENOIT Joseph A. DAY Cheryl GALLANT
Croatia	Boris BLAZEKOVIĆ Marin JURJEVIĆ Sandra PETROVIĆ
Denmark	Villum CHRISTENSEN Jeppe KOFOD John Dyrby PAULSEN
Estonia	Mati RAIDMA
France	Guy-Michel CHAUVEAU Odile SAUGUES
Germany	Jörg GEIBERT Anita SCHÄFER
Greece	Aristovoulos SPILIOPOULOS
Italy	Enzo BIANCO
Latvia	Sergejs POTAPKINS
Lithuania	Petras AUSTREVICIUS Juozas OLEKAS
Luxembourg	Claude ADAM Nancy ARENDT KEMP
Netherlands	Hendrik Jan ORMEL
Norway	Christian TYBRING-GJEDDE
Poland	Witold WASZCZYKOWSKI
Slovenia	Dragutin MATE
Spain	Enrique ABAD Iñaki Mirena ANASAGASTI José Ignacio PALACIOS Luis RODRIGUEZ-COMENDADOR
Turkey	Osman Askin BAK Muhammed CETIN Ahmet Berat CONKAR

United Kingdom	Lord HAMILTON OF EPSOM John ROBERSTON Sir John STANLEY
United States	Jo Ann EMERSON David SCOTT Michael TURNER
<b>Associate Delegations</b>	
Armenia	Koryun NAHAPETYAN
Austria	Gabriele MOSER
Azerbaijan	Gudrat HASANGULIYEV
Bosnia and Herzegovina	Milorad ZIVKOVIC
Georgia	Viktor DOLIDZE Giorgi KANDELAKI Irakli SESIASHVILI
Montenegro	Vasilije LALOSEVIC
Russian Federation	Nikolay MAKAROV Alexander SAVENKOV
Serbia	Igor BECIC Milos JOVANOVIC Dejan RADENKOVIC
Sweden	Clas-Göran CARLSSON
Switzerland	Peter BIERI Chantal GALLADE
the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia*	Pavle TRAJANOV
Ukraine	Yuriy SAMOILENKO Ostap SEMERAK Andriy SHKIL Oleg ZARUBINSKYI Ivan ZAIETS Ihor ZVARYCH
<b>Regional Partner and Mediterranean Associate Member Delegations</b>	
Algeria	Mohamed ELOUED
Jordan	Sami AL-KHASAWNEH Mohammed ALSAQQUR
Morocco	Hamid KOUSKOUS
<b>Parliamentary Observers</b>	
Kazakhstan	Mukhtar ALTYNBAYEV Bakhtiyar ARYKBAYEV Abay TASBULATOV
<b>Parliamentary Guests</b>	
Mongolia	Migeddorj BATCHIMEG

---

\* Turkey recognises the Republic of Macedonia with its constitutional name.

**Speakers**

**Hamed ABDEL-SAMAD**, German-Egyptian Political Scientist and Author, Member of the German Islam Conference

**Bohra BEL HAJ HMIDA**, Co-founder and former President of the Tunisian Association of Democratic Women

**Mari SKAARE**, NATO's Special Representative for Women, Peace and Security

**Ondrej SOUKUP**, Journalist for *Hospodarske Noviny*, Czech Republic

**Dr Rolf SCHWARZ**, Political Officer, Middle East and North Africa Section, NATO

**International Secretariat**

Andrius AVIZIUS, Director

Susanna POWER, Co-ordinator

Jakub KULHANEK, Research Assistant

## I. Opening Remarks

1. The acting Chairman, **Marc Angel** (Luxembourg), declared the Committee meeting open. After welcoming all members and guest speakers, the Chairman commended the Czech hosts for their exemplary organisation of the Prague Session. The Chairman underscored the timing of the session as it marked the 10<sup>th</sup> year anniversary of the NATO Summit in Prague, which took place in this very building in 2002.

2. **The draft agenda [138 CDS 12 E rev. 1] and the summary of the meeting held in Tallinn on 26 May 2012 [121 CDS 12 E] were adopted.**

## II. Presentation by Hamed Abdel-Samad, German-Egyptian Political Scientist and Author, Member of the German Islam Conference, on *The Lessons of the Arab Spring and the Implications for the Euro-Atlantic Community*

3. The presentation by **Hamed Abdel-Samad** centred around the broader implications of the Arab Spring. Mr Abdel-Samad began by emphasising that it was very difficult to present an accurate overview of the Arab Spring and its aftermath since it remained an open-ended process. For him, the political earthquake that brought down governments in the region has not automatically led to the victory of democracy but rather it has exposed the internal struggle within the Arab society. According to Mr Abdel-Samad, the Arab Spring is about the generational change in which young people with access to the internet and other means of communication aspire to live in a more open society than that of their parents.

4. The internet has gradually eroded the grip of authoritarian on the flow of information, thus in a large measure making the Arab Spring possible. Yet, the access to the internet is not helping only the democratic forces to spread their message but also others benefit from it, such as the hard-line fundamentalists. Mr Abdel-Samad argued that the Arab world was now undergoing the clash of civilisation that had been suppressed by the previous authoritarian governments. Both those who support democracy and those who oppose it vie for power and take advantage of modern means of communication. One can witness the effort by the fundamentalists to push for Sharia to become the primary source of legislation in Egypt, for instance. Across the region, non-religious parties fear that the introduction of Sharia might lead to the return of authoritarian rule. Nevertheless, Mr Abdel-Samad praised the Euro-Atlantic community for understanding that the Islamist-run governments should not be denied a chance to show that their policies are compatible with democracy.

5. In his presentation, Mr Abdel-Samad identified three challenges the Arab Spring posed to the Euro-Atlantic community: First, it is the growing influence of fundamentalism. The instability and chaos create an ideal environment for fundamentalists to take roots and attract new recruits. This has been happening in Yemen, Syria, the Sinai Peninsula and other places. Second, the Middle East peace process has come back to the forefront of the Arab politics. In the past, some rulers had engaged in unilateral peace talks with Israel with little regard for the sentiments in the society. There is now a push in some countries for renegotiating these peace treaties with Israel as the new governments begin to come under increasing pressure from the disgruntled public who feel cheated by the previous agreements. The third challenge lies in the demographic composition of the region where young people represent the largest segment of populations. The economic situation is particularly unforgiving to the young people of which as much as 40% are currently unemployed. Frustrated and impatient these young people become easily susceptible to the lure of extremism. In concluding his presentation, Mr Abdel-Samad warned the Euro-Atlantic community against indifference towards developments in the region as the cost of inaction could be high.

6. During the question and answer period, Mr Abdel-Samad touched on the role of Islam. He argued that the role of Islam was multifaceted and went beyond just political Islam. Answering the question about the drafting of a new Egyptian constitution, Mr Abdel-Samad said that the process deserved more attention from the international community. Finally, participants agreed that past attempts to maintain good relations with some dictators in the region proved to be self-defeating and should not be repeated.

### **III. Presentation by Bochra Bel Haj Hmida, Co-founder and former president of the Tunisian Association of Democratic Women, on *Women and the Arab Spring***

7. **Bochra Bel Haj Hmida** began her presentation by pointing out that in the past geopolitical circumstances were largely to blame for the democratic deficit in North Africa and the Middle East. She did say, however, that paradoxically some of these undemocratic regimes helped to improve the status of women in society. A good case in point was Tunisia under the regime of former president Ben Ali. In the aftermath of the Arab Spring, women are confronted with new challenges and have to face a risk of losing their rights.

8. Women's rights are now the subject of virulent debate in the Arab world. The Islamists are trying to sway the debate in favour of stripping women of their rights. In Bahrain women have been relegated to the status of second class citizens. In countries, such as Egypt, virginity tests have been reintroduced. However, those, such as the Salafi movement, who are opposed to more rights for women realise that they cannot simply decree the change from the top down. Rising tide of intermediation of women can be seen across the region. Therefore, the Salafists seek to infuse their ideas into the public debate on women's rights through grass-roots activism. With many countries engulfed in upheaval, the public opinion might become more receptive to radical ideologies.

9. In spite of her gloomy assessment, Mrs Bel Haj Hmida sounded quite upbeat on the women's ability to organise and defend their rights. She cited the example of some 60,000 Tunisian women who founded a *Facebook* page to help them stay organised and defend their cause. The key takeaways from Mrs Bel Haj Hmida's presentation were that it was important not to allow for the gradual erosion of women's rights.

10. During the question and answer session, questions focused on Algeria and Tunisia. Mrs Bel Haj Hmida discussed the protracted process of drafting a new constitution in Tunisia. She argued that under the guise of trying to promote pro-family policies the Islamists sought to attack women's rights. On Algeria, she noted positive progress in advancing women's rights but made it clear that much more had to be done.

### **IV. Consideration of the draft General Report *Consolidating the Revolutions in North Africa* [139 CDS 12 E] by Ulla Schmidt (Germany), General Rapporteur**

11. **Ulla Schmidt** presented the draft report on the situation in North Africa. She underscored the difficulty in writing the report because the situation on the ground was still evolving. Mrs Schmidt pointed out that after decades of tyranny the pace of transformation seemed nothing short of extraordinary. It was a crash course in democracy for the people of the region.

12. After describing general trends, Mrs Schmidt went on to dwell on the situation in individual countries in the region. As the birthplace of the Arab Spring, Tunisia warrants particular attention because it has the greatest potential to become a model for other Arab countries, showing that a democratic revolution can be successful. Mrs Schmidt focused on the process of drafting the new constitution which she viewed as essential to be completed soon.

13. On Egypt, Mrs Schmidt praised positive changes in facilitating the process of transition but she added that the recent elections showed that the Egyptian society was far from homogenous. She relayed the criticism that the Committee in charge of drafting the new constitution was seen as overly conservative. With respect to Libya, the General Rapporteur applauded the fact that the people have successfully elected a new parliament, and the elections were won by moderate forces. However, Mrs Schmidt expressed her concern over the security situation in the country, or lack thereof, and the government's not entirely successful effort to reign in military groups.

14. Mrs Schmidt also argued that Salafis, and particularly those with jihadist tendencies, are a clear minority in North Africa. The willingness of some Salafi parties to participate in the institutional democratic process should not be discouraged and we should not underestimate the resilience of the people of the region to radicalism and extremism, Mrs Schmidt said. Finally, the General Rapporteur reiterated the need for the Euro-Atlantic community to stay committed to the democratic transition of the region.

15. **The draft general Report [139 CDS 12 E] was adopted unanimously.**

#### **V. Committee Activities in 2013**

16. **Ulla Schmidt** expressed her interests in continuing her work on the Middle East and North Africa (MENA) region. The Sub-Committee Rapporteur, Lucio Malan, said he would like to prepare a report on Georgia. Some members suggested that the Committee in the upcoming year concentrated on the Western Balkans.

17. In terms of planned visits, members considered visits to Germany, the MENA region and Georgia next year. The possibility of a fact-finding mission to the Balkans was also discussed.

#### **VI. Presentation by Mari Skaare, NATO's Special Representative for Women, Peace and Security, on *NATO's Implementation of UNSCR 1325 and Related Resolutions***

18. Addressing the members, **Mari Skaare** first talked about her appointment as NATO Secretary General's Special Representative for Women, Peace and Security. She stated that her role was to enhance implementation of NATO's policy on women in the realm of security. Ms Skaare underscored the importance of the United Nations Security Council Resolution 1325 and other related resolutions as the basis for her work. There are two main messages embedded in these resolutions that are particularly important: First, women become particularly vulnerable during the time of war. Second, women can play an important role in resolving armed conflicts.

19. The UNSCR 1325 calls on states to ensure increased representation of women in institutions dealing with prevention, management and resolution of conflicts. With respect to NATO, Ms Skaare pointed out that NATO member states should redouble their effort to recruit and retain women in their armed forces. For example, the Alliance has placed gender advisors and experts at its headquarters, as well as in operation theatres in Afghanistan and Kosovo.

20. Ms Skaare noted that there was much stronger political will today than a few years ago. According to Ms Skaare, the overall aim should be to raise awareness and to work toward greater female participation in the areas of defence and security. Training and education can be major force multipliers.

21. After her presentation, Ms Skaare went on to answer questions from the Committee members. Asked about the situation of women in Afghanistan, she said that it was difficult to monitor progress on the ground. She expressed her concern about rising gender violence. The members also discussed how to improve reporting on gender issues in NATO armies.

**VII. Presentation by Ondrej Soukup, Journalist for *Hospodarske Noviny*, the Czech Republic, on *Internal Political Developments in Russia and Possible Implications for Russia's Relations with the Euro-Atlantic Community***

22. Czech journalist **Ondrej Soukup** presented his view on current trends in Russian politics and how they affected Moscow's conduct of foreign policy. According to Mr Soukup recent erratic steps taken by the Kremlin indicated that the regime was becoming worried about potentially losing control.

23. Mr Soukup argued that the social contract that made it possible for Vladimir Putin to stay in power was unravelling. According to Mr Soukup, there were two groups in the Kremlin – hawks and doves. The former now seem to be gaining the upper hand as they keep pushing for more tough measures to be taken against the opposition.

24. In terms of Russian foreign policy, the Kremlin will likely continue to cultivate the image of Russia as a besieged fortress with the hope to rally domestic support behind the regime. The ultimate goal of Russian foreign policy will be to prevent any outside interference in country's domestic affairs. Mr Soukup argued that the Kremlin would like to see the return to the times of *Ostpolitik*, whereby domestic affairs were not the subject of discussion between Moscow and Western countries. But this was hardly possible to attain nowadays, explained Mr Soukup.

25. During the question and answer session, the members agreed that there were different trends at play in Russian politics and it was often difficult to determine where Russia was heading. The members also talked about their recent visit to Russia.

**VIII. Consideration of the draft Report of the Sub-Committee on Democratic Governance *The Forces of Change and Continuity in Russia: Domestic and International Implications* [140 CDS DG 12 E] by Lucio Malan (Italy), Rapporteur**

26. **Lucio Malan** presented his draft report on Russia in which he highlighted some liberalisation measures, introduced earlier in the year, following unprecedented political protests across Russia. However, the liberalisation trend has been reversed in the second part of the year as a number of measures were introduced to impose stricter rules on NGOs and media to direct actions by law enforcement agencies against some opposition activists.

27. Still, Lucio Malan emphasised that the aim of his report was to analyse rather than criticise. Mr Malan disagreed with the notion that the "tightening the screws" could ensure enduring stability. Therefore, the report recommends that the Russian state engages in dialogue with the opposition while allowing gradual liberalisation. Mr Malan argued that Russia could benefit from greater freedom of media and political plurality.

28. On Russian foreign policy, Lucio Malan expected certain continuity. He made a point that Russia's greatness and prominence on the international stage in a large measure depended more than anything else on its ability to play a constructive role in international crises.

29. **The draft Report [140 CDS DG 12 E] was adopted.**



**IX. Consideration of the draft Special Report on *The Movement of People Across the Mediterranean: New Trends and Challenges* [141 CDS 12 E] by Vitalino Canas (Portugal), Special Rapporteur**

30. **Vitalino Canas** stressed the complex nature of the refugee crisis currently facing the EU. He pointed out that it was important to understand these trends in global context. Most refugees did not go to Europe or other wealthy countries, but instead to developing countries which hosted about 85% of all refugees. Although North African countries are a major source of migrants to Europe, these countries are also receivers of migrants and refugees from Sub-Saharan Africa and their neighbours.

31. However, Vitalino Canas went on to explain that the refugee crisis suffered by European countries in the first half of 2011 was a serious one. Moreover, Turkey now has to cope with a refugee crisis of its own as Syrian refugees try to escape from their war-torn country. The Rapporteur pointed out that the 2011 refugee crisis exposed a fundamental problem to the European Union: while the members are “integrated” through the Schengen agreement, they are not “integrated” enough when it comes to sharing the burdens of the refugee influx.

32. Discussing his recommendations, Mr Canas suggested that the Alliance should step up its co-operation in crisis management, civil emergency planning and border security in the Mediterranean. In addition, NATO naval assets in the region are obliged by the international law to provide assistance to people in distress at sea. Finally, the Alliance should make effective use of NATO’s Euro-Atlantic Disaster and Response Coordination Center (EADRCC), co-ordinating assistance to countries affected by refugee crises.

33. In the subsequent discussion, the members expressed their frustration over the lack of co-operation and co-ordination between some countries, especially in the area of repatriation of refugees. They also touched on the issue of long-term integration of immigrants.

34. **The draft Special Report [141 CDS 12 E] was adopted.**

**X. Presentation by Dr Rolf Schwarz, Political Officer, Middle East and North Africa Section, NATO, on *NATO’s Outreach to the Mediterranean and the Middle East Region***

35. Dr Schwarz began his presentation by describing far-reaching implications of the Arab Spring for the Euro-Atlantic area. He praised the long-term involvement of the Alliance in the MENA region as positive which also helped build a broad coalition in support of the no-fly zone over Libya.

36. Dr Schwarz then went on to catalogue different formats of co-operation NATO had been pursuing with countries in the region. He informed the Committee members about the increased dialogue with Mediterranean Dialogue countries. Furthermore, since 2004 the annual Mediterranean Dialogue Work Programme and the Istanbul Cooperation Initiative’s Menu of Practical Cooperation focusing on 30 areas of co-operation have been open to all interested countries. Dr Schwarz emphasised that in the years to come the Alliance would like to focus on more tailored partnerships. To that end, the Alliance will utilise Individual and Partnership Cooperation Programmes (IPCPs) as its main tool to structure co-operation with countries in the region.

37. Finally, Dr Schwarz emphasised that the Alliance had to tread carefully in the region while relying on robust public diplomacy. Careful attention must be paid for NATO not to be misperceived as intrusive or wishing to take advantage of the current phase of domestic changes taking place in partner countries.

**XI. Consideration of amendments and vote on the draft Resolution on *The Democratic Transition in the Middle East and North Africa* [181 CDS 12 E] presented by Ulla Schmidt (Germany), General Rapporteur**

38. **Ulla Schmidt** summarised some of the following key points of the resolution:

- The resolution provides a balanced statement of how we assess the changes occurring in this region, and what we can do as an Alliance.
- It expresses its support for the democratic aspirations and universal rights of all people in the region.
- It encourages NATO member states to reaffirm their commitment to assisting the new democratic governments provide a secure and stable environment for citizens in this challenging time, to enable NATO to increase practical assistance to countries of the region, and to consider the need to revitalise NATO's partnerships with countries in the region.
- It also draws particular attention to the urgent need to protect the weakest and the most vulnerable groups in these societies, including women and ethnic and religious minorities.

39. Several amendments were proposed by members of the Committee and three of them were accepted.

**The draft Resolution [181 CDS 12 E], as amended, was adopted.**

**XII. Consideration of amendments and vote on the draft Resolution on *The Future of Democracy in the Eastern Neighbourhood* [182 CDS 12 E] presented Lucio Malan (Italy), Rapporteur**

40. **Lucio Malan** summarised some of the following key points of the resolution:

- The resolution initially focused only on Belarus, Russia and Ukraine. However, during the amendment process the geographic scope of the resolution was expanded to include Georgia.
- The resolution stresses that the democratic transition process in these countries has always been uneven, where periods of liberalisation would be followed by periods of new restrictions, and *vice versa*.
- It expresses concern over the reversal of the liberalisation trend in Russia and the introduction of new restrictive laws.
- It urges free and fair elections while calling on the governments in the region to ensure that civil society organisations can flourish and the media can operate freely.

41. Seventeen amendments were proposed by members of the Committee. Having agreed to include Georgia in the resolution, the members called on the new government and the President of Georgia to work together to ensure effective cohabitation. During the amending process, the members also expressed their concern over the fate of some opposition politicians in Ukraine.

**The draft Resolution [182 CDS 12 E], as amended, was adopted.**

**XIII. Election of Committee and Sub-Committee officers**

42. The Chairman announced the procedure for election of Committee and Sub-Committee officers for 2012-2013.

43. All officers eligible for re-election were re-elected. The following new candidates were elected:

***Sub-Committee on Democratic Governance***

Chairperson	<b>Vitalino Canas (Portugal)</b>
Vice-Chairperson	<b>Mati Raidma (Estonia)</b>
Special Rapporteur	<b>Witold Waszczykowski (Poland)</b>

**Ukraine-NATO Interparliamentary Council**

CDS member	<b>Ulla Schmidt (Germany)</b>
CDS alternate members	<b>Enzo Bianco (Italy)</b>
	<b>Vitalino Canas (Portugal)</b>

**XIV. Any other business and closing remarks**

44. The Chairperson thanked the Czech Delegation and their staff for organising a successful session in Prague. The Committee was closed until its next meeting in Luxemburg in May 2013.

-----